



EVALUATION OF TWO ENGLISH TEXTBOOKS USED BY THE SEVENTH GRADE STUDENTS IN PAPUA

*Manase Halitopo, Napius Kogoya,

*STKIP Abdi Wacana Wamena, Jalan Yos Sudarso. Wamena 99511, Papua Indonesia

Corresponding author: manasaehalitopo11@gmail.com / napiuskogoya93@gmail.com

Abstract

The objective of this research is to describe the qualities of the English textbooks used by the seventh grade students of Junior High School. This research belongs to evaluation research. The object of this research were two English textbooks, they are Bahasa Inggris, and Mandiri Practice Your English Competence for the seventh grade of Junior High School. This research adapted Cunningsworth's theory to obtain information in order to describe the qualities of these textbooks. The data were obtained through interview, and document analysis. The data were analyzed through four steps: data collection, data reduction, data display, and conclusion. The results showed that Bahasa Inggris fulfills seven of eight criteria of a good textbook and was categorized as partly suitable. Moreover, Mandiri Practice Your English Competence meets mostly of the criteria of good textbook and was categorized suitable. According to the results, the researchers recommended Mandiri Practice Your English Competence to be used by the teachers and seventh grade students of Junior High School because this book almost fulfilled all sub-criteria.

Keywords: Textbooks Evaluation, Criteria of Good Textbook, Cunningsworth's Criteria.



INTRODUCTION

In Indonesia, English has been introduced in junior high school, senior high school, and universities. It becomes one of the compulsory subjects of learning. The purpose of learning English is to develop four skills. They are: listening, writing, reading and speaking. There are parts that are involved in the teaching and learning process among them, teachers and students.

The successfulness of English teaching-learning process can be influenced by many components, one of them is learning material.

Many things can assist teachers in presenting the material when the teaching-learning process. Tomlinson (1998) states that materials can be in the form of a textbook, a workbook, a cassette, a CD-room, a video, a photocopied handout, a newspaper, a paragraph written on a whiteboard: anything which presents or informs about the language being learned.

As cited by Cunningsworth in Handayani (2016) that textbooks provide educational text which can be used as sources of material for teaching and learning. In other words, textbooks are learning materials commonly used by teacher in teaching-learning process. However, it should consider for several reasons. First, in the aspect of the economy, second, textbooks relate considerable importance in the academic growth and success of students at all levels of education. Third, for the teachers who are inexperienced or occasionally unsure for their knowledge of the language, the textbook can provide useful guidance and support. Fourth, teachers might gladly use textbooks because they do not have the time themselves to prepare appropriate material for their students.

Teachers should select a suitable textbook that is appropriate for their students. As Brown in Hanifa (2018) states that teachers can have conversations, role-plays, discussions, and chalkboard work, but much of the richness of language instruction is derived from

supporting material. Therefore, choosing a good textbook is important because many textbooks seem not suitable to the needs of the students and criteria of good textbook.

In this context, textbook evaluation is needed as it helps English teacher in making the decision on which textbook they will use as cited by Waters in Bayezid Towhidiyan (2014) believe that textbook evaluation is basically a straightforward, analytical “matching process; matching needs to available solution. In addition, it also helps textbooks authors in designing good textbooks.

However, the researcher designs the evaluation study to elucidate the strengths and weaknesses of the textbooks as used in the teaching and learning context especially in Wamena Papua, and to know whether they are in accordance with the criteria of good textbooks or not, refer to the evaluation criteria based on Cunningsworth (1995).

RESEARCH METHOD

This study is evaluation research because it is conducted by evaluating the textbooks. It has purpose to assess the quality of the textbook whether it is appropriate or not with the criteria of good textbooks proposed by Cunningsworth (1995).

The objects of this study are two English textbooks for the seventh grade of Junior High School. The first book is “Bahasa Inggris” as textbook 1. The second book is “Mandiri Practice Your English Competence” as textbook 2.

Data collection is an important activity in this research. First, documentation analysis, the researchers analyzed the data based on Cunningsworth’s (1995) checklist. This checklist includes eight categories. They are aims and approaches, design and organization, language content, skills, topic, methodology, teacher’s book, and practical considerations. Second, interview was conducted in order to support the researcher’s findings in evaluating two textbooks based on the Cunningsworth theory.



In analyzing the data, the researchers used the following steps based on Miles Huberman and Saldana (2014). The first was data collection in which the researcher collected the data that were taken through document analysis and interviews. The researcher observed the content of two English textbooks such as the tasks, dialogues, and activities for four skills. The second was data reduction in which the researchers made a decision on which data to code and elaborated. The third was data display in which the researchers selected some tasks, dialogue, and activities in form of pictures as the evidence whether the contents of the textbooks are appropriate or not with the criteria of a good textbook by Cunningsworth. Fourth, after all the data has been processed (collecting, reducing and displaying the data), the researchers drew the conclusion based on the result of the research.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

The researchers found the qualities of the two English textbooks based on the criteria of good textbook by Cunningsworth (1995).

Table 1

Summary of the Qualities of Two English Textbooks with Criteria of a good Textbook

No.	Criterion	Quality	
		T1	T2
1.	Aim and Approaches	S	S
2.	Design and Organization	S	S
3.	Language Content	PS	PS
4.	Skills	PS	S
5	Topic	S	S
6	Methodology	S	S
7	Teacher's Book	S	
8	Political Consideration	S	S

Note: S: Suitable, PS: Partly Suitable

Aims and Approaches

Two textbooks are categorized "Suitable" to the criteria namely aims and approaches. The aims of all textbooks are suitable with the aims of the teaching program. They are also suited to the need of the learners which increasing students' skills in learning English in the form of written and spoken, the learning materials are presented based on daily life. The materials in the textbooks are a good resource for students and teachers, it is because the textbooks serve the materials according to the topics with a clear definition, example and also the activity which are suitable to the need of the learners. In short, the two English textbooks are comprehensive.

Design and Organization

The criteria of design and organization of two English textbooks are categorized suitable. The total course package components of textbook 1 include the teacher's book and student's book. Meanwhile, textbook 2 has a workbook, additional listening material, audio for listening and pronunciation. The contents of the two textbooks are organized according to the topics. Each chapter has a different topic that refers to the content. These books provide learning material that relates to each other. It can be revealed from the material given, in this case, is in terms of the activities of the textbook.

Language Content

In language content, textbook 1 is categorized partly suitable in this criterion. This book does not provide tasks or activities related to develop students' pronunciation ability. Students learned pronunciation implicitly through listening, reading or speaking section. This analysis is confirmed by the interrater who approves that textbook 1 does not provide any tasks related to pronunciation activity.

Table 2. *The Interview of Language Content in Textbook 1*

No.	Object	Utterances
1.	Researcher	Bu, Klo di buku Kemendikbud kan tidak diajarkan khusus untuk pronunciation.
2.	Interrater	Klo pronunciation memang tidak diajarkan jadi itu guru yang ajar cara mengucapkannya dengan benar.

It is clearly accepted that textbook 1 does not fulfill this criterion. The textbook does not include the material for pronunciation work. The pronunciation of the students is implicitly taught through the reading or speaking section.

Meanwhile, the grammar section of textbook 2 is laid out on the essential grammar section in each chapter. It contains grammar rules that are provided explicitly.

Table 3. *The Interview of Language Content in Textbook 2*

No.	Object	Utterances
1.	Researcher	Bu, Klo penyajian untuk grammarnya bagaimana menurut ibu.
2.	Interrater	Jadi kalau untuk textbook 2 ini agak rumit. Anak-anak yang melihat ini saja agak sulit/susah yang seperti ini.

The interrater's point of view about the grammar of textbook 2 which has the same opinion to the researcher. She said that the grammar item of textbook 2 is difficult to understand.

Skills

The criteria of skills are categorized partly suitable in textbook 1. Four skills are not adequately covered in this book. It fails in providing listening material, there is no task related to develop students listening skill. The listening skill is not discussed in the textbook compared to speaking, reading and writing skill. In addition, textbook 1 has the activity of reading passage that the texts are not too short and too long. However, the texts that are provided in textbook 1 are not sufficient enough, because it is not covered in each chapter of the textbook. Meanwhile, textbook 2 succeeds in covering four skills, they are covered by some activities provided. Listening material is one of the features of textbook 2. This book presents listening material in each chapter. It is supported by utilizing the digital tool through QR codes. The audio within the textbook is in the form of digital content that are presented by scanning the QR codes.

Topic

In the criteria of the topic, these two textbooks have a variety and range of the topic. One and another in the next topic are different. Each chapter has a different topic in which the topic is suited to the learning objectives of teaching program which is the 2013 curriculum. The topic of the two textbooks will be able to help students much to expand and enrich their experience. The topics provided by the textbooks are familiar to the learners. So, the materials of the topics are related to their daily life that can develop a student's awareness.

Teacher's Book

In the criteria of the teacher's book, textbook 1 is categorized as Suitable. The teacher's book of textbook 1 gives more guidance for the teacher who will implement this textbook. It explains how to convey the material based on the provided activities in the textbook, what approaches used, and what should teacher says at the beginning and during the lesson, from opening until closing



section. It represents guidance in the opening, main activity contains pre-activity, building blocks, lets practice, active conversation, writing connection, let's create/contribute, and the last is closing. Unfortunately, textbook 2 did not provide any particular book for the teachers.

Political Consideration

The last, in the criteria of political consideration, the two textbooks are categorized "Suitable". The package cost of two textbooks is not really expensive or even it is cheaper than another textbook and it represents good value for money since it is affordable. The cost of the books especially for textbook 1 is Rp.100.000-120.000. Furthermore, textbook 2 represents good value for money. For its cost, it is Rp. 300.000-350.000. The two textbooks are strong and long-lasting. The cover is made of solid paper but still easy to be folded and comfortable to hold.

CONCLUSION

Textbook 1 is a textbook developed by the Ministry of Education and Culture. This textbook has fourteen chapters of material that are developed based on the syllabus of the 2013 curriculum that mostly used scientific approach as the methodology in the teaching and learning process. This book provides the learning objectives which are suitable to the syllabus of the 2013 curriculum. Textbook 1 provides the tasks that are most interesting for the students and it covers a variety of topics. In summary, textbook 1 does not fully fulfill the eight criteria of a good textbook by Cunningsworth thoroughly. The criteria are fulfilled in textbook 1 are Aims and Approaches, Design and Organization, Topic, Methodology, and Political Consideration. Meanwhile, other criteria are not fulfilled yet.

Textbook 2 is published by Erlangga. This textbook is developed based on the syllabus of the 2013 curriculum, as can be seen on the learning objectives of every unit which is presented on the first page of the textbook. This textbook contains

six chapters with interesting topics that are appropriate with the student's needs, interest and level. In summary, textbook 2 meets most of the criteria proposed by Cunningsworth. It covers Aims and Approaches, Design and Organization, Language Content, Skills, Topic, Methodology and Practical Consideration. Hence, teacher's book criteria are not available.

REFERENCES

Bayezid Towhidiyan, M. S. (2014). The Evaluation of "Engsih Textbook 2" Taught in Iranian High School from Teachers' Perspective. *English Language Teaching*, 150-158.

Cunningsworth, A. (1995). *Choosing Your Coursebook*. London: Oxford Heinemann Publishers

Handayani, S. (2016). EVALUATION OF ENGLISH TEXTBOOK FOR GRADE VII OF JUNIOR HIGH SCHOOL IN INDONESIA. *Fourth International Seminar on English Language Teaching*, 328-339.

Hanifa, R. (2018). EFL Published Materials: An Evaluation of English Textbooks for Junior High School in Indonesia. *Advance in Language and Literary Studies*, 167-174.

Miles, M.B., Huberman, A.M., dan Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative Data Analysis, A Methods Sourcebook*, Edition 3. USA: Sage Publications. Terjemahan Tjetjep Rohindi Rohidi, UI-Press

Tomlinson, B. (1998). *Materials Development in Language Teaching*. Cambridge University Press.



NATIONAL SEMINAR OF PBI

NSPBI 2024

Promoting Learner Autonomy in a Technology-Enhanced Language Learning Environment